### Transit on the Beltline: Neither Catalyst Nor Transport

Hans Klein, Georgia Tech

Presented at Atlanta Studies Symposium Panel *"The Desire for Streetcars.* Is the Beltline a Rail Corridor Or a Linear Park?"

Panelists

Prof. Mike Dobbins, Georgia Institute of Technology (School of City & Regional Planning) Walter Brown, Former Senior Vice President of Development, Jamestown Prof. Hans Klein, Georgia Institute of Technology (School of Public Policy)

11 May 2023

## The Project: The Streetcar East (SCE) Extension

- Extend the Downtown Loop streetcar
- 2.3 miles, \$230M
- Run rail on the Beltline

#### • Should we do it or not?

- "Yes!"
  - Mayor, City Council, Atlanta Beltline Inc., grassroot groups
- "No?"
  - MARTA?, developers, planners, grassroot groups

## The Key to the Debate: What is Transit?

#### Vision 1: Transit is a catalyst

- The Beltline vision (Gravel 1999)
- A catalyst for "smart" urbanism
  - Central city revitalization, residential density, car-free living
  - Social integration, racial harmony, connecting neighborhoods
- Much more than mere transportation

#### • Vision 2: Transit is transportation

- Connects origins and destinations
- Justified by ridership studies
- Expenditures subject to cost-benefit analysis
- A less visionary, more practical view

# Today's Debate: Should we Deploy SCE?

Let's ask this question in light of the 2 visions

- 1. Is SCE justified as transportation?
  - No
    - High cost: \$100M per mile
    - Low benefit: insufficient ridership
    - An objective test: does it qualify for federal support? No.

#### 2. Is SCE justified as a catalyst?

- *No* 
  - We found another catalyst: Beltline as a park
  - 2.1 million annual visitors
  - Has catalyzed smart urbanism
    - Ponce City Market, New City, Krog Street, Lee+White, Milton Avenue

#### Transit is no longer needed for the broad goals (smart urbanism) Transit is not justified for the narrow goal (transportation)

## What Should We Do Instead?

#### 1. Deploy transit elsewhere

- Transit can still be a catalyst -- just not on the Beltline
  - Other More MARTA projects
  - North Ave., Northside Drive. Summerhill, Campbellton Rd, Clifton Corridor
- Promote smart urbanism
  - Pursue Gravel's vision city-wide, not just on the Beltline
- 2. Double down on the Beltline as a park
  - Add a LIT Lane (bikes, e-bikes, scooter, skate boards)
    - Address congestion, safety problems
    - LIT is a kind of transit
      - As being done on 15<sup>th</sup> Street
  - Keep the option to add transit in the future

### Summary

- Spending \$230M on the streetcar extension is
  - Ineffective transit
  - Unnecessary for urban development
- Instead:
  - Reallocate the funds
    - Other More MARTA
  - Build on the park
    - Add LIT "transit"